

# **PRIVATISATION: Sell off or sell out?**

## **The Australian experience**

**by Dr. Bob Walker & Betty Con Walker**

Published by ABC Books for the Australian Broadcasting Commission

First published 2000

ISBN 0 7333 0797 3

## **CONTENTS**

### **1 INTRODUCTION 1**

- Politicians have let us down 4
- Public servants have let us down 6
- Failure of parliamentary oversight 7
- Consequences 8
- Alternative approaches: A better way 15

### **2 SALE OF THE DECADE 17**

- Privatisation by level of government 18
- Privatisation by sector 18
- Privatisation by value 19
- Privatisation by type of sale 19
- Privatisations completed 20
- Privatisations announced but not completed 23
- Transfer of wealth 24
- What's next? 25
- Potential sales of government trading enterprises 26
- Emphasis may shift from 'sales' to 'outsourcing' or ' 26
- Privatisation in stages? 34

### **3 TOUTING PRIVATISATION 37**

- Crisis in government finances 39
- Claims:
  - 'The proceeds of privatisation could reduce the budget deficit' 42
  - 'The proceeds of privatisation could reduce government debt' 48
  - 'The proceeds of privatisation could reduce the burden of interest costs as a result of a reduction in debt' 58
  - 'The proceeds of privatisation by reducing debt will maintain (or improve) our credit rating and keep interest costs down' 59
- Investing in other things 63
- Claims:
  - 'The proceeds of privatisation could be used by governments to do things sooner' 63
  - 'The proceeds of privatisation could be spent on alternative ventures' 67
- Reducing risk 70
- Claim:
  - 'The sale of government trading enterprises would avoid involvement in risky 70
- Increasing efficiency/Reducing costs 75

Claim:

‘Privatisation is necessary because government trading enterprises are inefficient and more efficient private sector firms can provide the same services at lower cost’ 75

Selling like the rest 77

Claims:

‘The sale of a government trading enterprise is necessary because part of it has already

‘The sale of a government trading enterprise is necessary because the industry is privatised in other countries’ 78

Selling before the price falls 80

Claim:

‘The sale of a government trading enterprise is necessary because if it isn’t sold now,

Summary 82

#### **4 GOVERNMENT TRADING ENTERPRISES HAVE BEEN UNDERVALUED 84**

Assessing the case for privatisation 86

How ‘GTE accounting’ differs from private sector accounting 87

How efficient are Australia’s GTEs? 91

Initial analysis of Steering Committee on National Performance Monitoring of Government Trading Enterprises 95

Efforts to standardise GTE accounting 96

Impact of accounting methods on reported profits of GTEs 97

Profitability of GTEs - using private sector accounting 104

Understatement of GTE profits 109

How can the performance of GTEs be assessed? 112

Effect of capital structure on reported profits of GTEs 116

Profits versus dividends 117

Postscript 118

#### **5 TO SELL OR NOT TO SELL: FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS 121**

Analysis of cash flows 122

‘Modelling’ the privatisation decision 128

Retention value 129

Proceeds of sale 129

Implications of analysis 136

Estimating retention values - in practice 140

Critical assumptions about ‘the cost of capital’ 143

#### **6 CONTRACTING OUT / OUTSOURCING 144**

The rhetoric of outsourcing 148

Steering not rowing 150

The hit-or-miss way some governments have gone about outsourcing 153

Misinformation about the benefits of outsourcing 157

Shortcomings in public sector management information systems don’t help 161

Financial analysis and accounting distortions 165

Application to the public sector 165

The outsourcing decision – financial considerations 169  
Flaws in some government-issued guidelines on outsourcing 172  
Non-financial considerations 176  
Public service pensions and outsourcing 180  
What lies ahead? 182

## **7 PRIVATE SECTOR INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT 189**

Private sector use of ‘financial engineering’ 189  
The role of the Loan Council 190  
Finding ways around the global limits 191  
How the Loan Council gave the game away 195  
Further erosion of accountability 199  
Privatisation through off-budget financing of infrastructure projects 202  
BOOT schemes can be highly expensive 203  
The period of BOOT schemes is getting longer and longer 208  
Off-balance sheet financing arrangements affect urban planning 212  
The extent of off budget financing arrangements 212  
Back-door financing avoids accountability to parliament and the public 213  
Disclosure of contract summaries? 218  
Reforms needed to restore accountability 221

## **8 AUSTRALIA’S WORST PRIVATISATIONS 224**

Loss of value to the public sector 224  
    CSL Ltd 224  
    Telstra 225  
Loss of services to the community 229  
    Commonwealth Bank 229  
    Housing Loans Insurance Corporation 230  
Loss of commercial and social opportunities 233  
    Telstra 234  
    CSL Ltd 234  
Badly handled privatisations 240  
    Intimidation to prevent public debate: HLIC 240  
    Undermining value: ANL 242  
    High transaction costs: GIO 247  
    Eroding investor protections: GIO 251  
    Poorly designed sale arrangements: Pipeline Authority 257  
    Sale at any price: State Bank of New South Wales 265  
Wooden spoon award: Australia’s worst privatisation 274

## **9 A BETTER WAY 276**

Debate about the role of government 276  
More careful and skilful analysis 282  
Improved accountability for the use of public resources 285  
Fostering the values of public service 292  
Better qualified people 295  
Separating players from score keepers 298  
Final comment 299

**APPENDIX TO CHAPTER 5**

**A NOTE ON THE CONCEPT OF 'COST OF CAPITAL' 300**

History of the idea of 'cost of capital' 301

Selection of a discount rate to evaluate projects in the private sector 304

Selection of a discount rate to evaluate public sector investments 309

Use of discounted cash flow analysis in 'valuing' businesses 313

Cost of capital for government – when examining privatisation 314

What happens in practice? 319

**REFERENCES 322**

**INDEX 331**